Comparative analysis of adherence to rules and regulations in public and religious schools in Sabang City

Maimun*, Alfi Oktaviani, Erna Hayati

*Department of Civic Education, Universitas Syiah Kuala, Banda Aceh, Indonesia
Teacher of Pancasila and Civic Education at SMA 1 Sabang, Aceh, Indonesia

Abstract: Education is a process of changing the behavior of students, meanwhile, school is a vehicle for developing the behavior of students who have not been able to play its role optimally. This study aims to determine the differences in obedience to the rules between SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang, to find out the factors that form student obedience to the rules in SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang. This study uses a mix methods research that combines quantitative and qualitative research. The results showed that (1) there were differences in student obedience to discipline between public schools and religious schools with a sig value of 0.029 < 0.05. (2) the factors that form student obedience to discipline are influenced by two factors, namely internal factor and external factors and with the support of school and community environmental factors.

Keywords: Adherence; public schools; religious school.

Introduction

Education within the school environment is highly anticipated to direct students towards the enhancement of knowledge, attitudes, and skills. This implies that, following the educational process received, students are expected to acquire what they desire. Education represents a process of behavioral change in students, whereas the school serves as a vehicle for developing student behavior that has not yet optimally fulfilled its role. Education in a school setting is invariably linked to existing rules, encompassing both written and unwritten regulations, which must be fully adhered to. The existence of these rules aims to create a highly conducive environment and ensure a sense of justice for all students within the school. However, in reality, many students still violate the rules established by the authoritative bodies in these educational institutions.

School rules are established to enable students to adapt to the school environment, exercise self-control, and take greater responsibility for their duties as students, as well as to behave in accordance with national education goals. This is aimed at shaping students who contribute positively to nation-building. Examples include adhering to school regulations, respecting teachers, showing respect to schoolmates, refraining from demeaning peers, creating a safe and orderly classroom environment, and abiding by the rules within the school premises. Conscious obedience to these rules is a fundamental asset for fostering attitudes that are both positive and productive. ‘Positive’ in this context means being aware of the goals to be achieved, while ‘productive’ implies consistently engaging in beneficial activities. For instance, students who habitually study regularly at school and at home train their brains daily. Adherence to school discipline teaches students to respect and follow other general rules and develop habits worth cultivating. According to the National Education System Law (UU Sidiknas) No. 20 of 2003, Chapter V, Article 12, paragraph 2(a), it is the duty of students to maintain educational norms to ensure the continuity and success of the educational process. Schools are charged with developing norms within the school environment...
to accustom students to maintaining and adhering to these norms, which are integrated into school regulations. This is as noted by Ratih Priatin Dwi Jayanti (2014:422).

School regulations serve as fundamental guidelines encompassing policies that regulate the psychological imbalances of students, which during their development can lead to deviations in interpersonal interactions among students, between students and teachers, and between students and the school principal. To address the issues present in the school environment, it's essential to formulate specific strategies to halt these deviations. These potential deviations are likely to continuously emerge due to the psychological development of students in their learning activities. Furthermore, the influence of the environment and the progression of a child's age significantly heightens the student's awareness of their existence. The enforcement of school discipline aims to cultivate student discipline, thereby enhancing the conduciveness of the learning process. Additionally, it emphasizes the importance of adhering to school discipline for the overall effectiveness of educational outcomes, as noted by Ratih (2014).

However, in reality, it is often observed that some students still do not adhere to the school discipline rules. Maintaining order among students frequently poses a challenge in schools, with various kinds of violations committed by them. Examples include not participating in ceremonies, arriving late to school, leaving during class hours, among other infractions. A lack of student awareness in obeying school discipline can lead to negative consequences for the students themselves. Students often perceive school discipline as merely a restriction of their freedom, resulting in frequent breaches of these rules. In essence, school discipline is not just an administrative formality, but a crucial part of the students' lives and a necessity for the school itself. Adherence to these disciplinary rules by students is key to creating a safe environment conducive to the smooth progress of educational processes. School regulations must include punitive sanctions for violations. The enforcement of these rules, considered a last resort, must take into account the development of the students.

Additionally, there exists another phenomenon observed among the community, particularly in their differentiation between public schools and religious schools. According to popular belief, religious schools are thought to produce more competent and religious students who are expected to exhibit better morals and manners compared to those attending public schools. Such assumptions by the community can lead to a decline in the reputation of public schools, under the presumption that they are incapable of developing students with good morals and manners, and vice versa. This public perception does not exclude schools like SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang.

SMA Negeri 1 Sabang is a public school accredited with an ‘A’ grade, attracting a high interest among students seeking admission. The school has achieved numerous accolades in various competitions. SMA Negeri 1 Sabang boasts a faculty comprising graduates from quality higher education institutions, also accredited with an ‘A’. Combined with contemporary teaching methods, this creates a dynamic classroom atmosphere. In 2022, SMA Negeri 1 Sabang successfully sent one of its students to represent the Aceh province as a member of the National PASKIBRAKA, along with numerous other notable student achievements.

MAN Sabang is a religious school under the auspices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, often favored by many parents for educating their children. Like SMA Negeri 1 Sabang, MAN Sabang also holds an ‘A’ accreditation and boasts a team of qualified and appealing educators. The school has achieved notable successes, such as winning first place in a religious quiz competition in the city of Sabang, organized by the Dinas Syariat Islam Kota Sabang, and securing third place in a province-wide competition held by the Dinas Syariat Islam Provinsi Aceh. Both schools undoubtedly have their respective strengths and weaknesses, and should not be compared solely based on their educational methods and curricula, which are inherently different. The obedience and discipline exhibited by students are not solely determined by the school they attend, but rather by the collaboration of competent teaching and the nurturing of good morals.

Considering the issues outlined above, the researcher is deeply intrigued to investigate these matters further to determine whether there truly exists a difference in the adherence to school rules between the two aforementioned schools, as suggested by the available data. Therefore, the researcher is interested in conducting a study on The Comparison of Adherence to School Rules Between Public Schools and Religious Schools in the City of Sabang.

Based on the background provided, the research questions formulated for this study are: (1) How does the adherence to school discipline compare between students at SMA
Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang? (2) What are the factors contributing to student obedience to school discipline at SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang?

**Method**

This study employs a mixed-methods approach, combining quantitative and qualitative research methodologies. The population for this study includes all students of SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang, along with 14 teachers from both schools. Generally, a good sample is one that represents as many characteristics of the population as possible. If the subject number is less than 100, it is preferable to include all. However, if the subject number exceeds 100, a sample size of 10%–15% or 20%–25% can be taken. In this study, as the population exceeds 100 respondents, the researcher has chosen to take 15% from a total of 856, resulting in a sample size of 128 respondents. For the qualitative research, the sample consists of principals, Vice-Principals of Student Affairs, Guidance and Counseling Teachers, and 4 Subject Teachers. To obtain relevant data and information, the researcher has decided to conduct the study in SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang.

Data collection techniques in this study include: (1) Questionnaires, which involve asking questions or distributing them. (2) Structured interviews, a crucial data collection tool in qualitative communication research. (3) Observations, systematically recording the behavior of individuals or groups being studied directly. Data analysis techniques in this study include: (1) Data reduction, focusing on simplifying, abstracting, and transforming raw data from field notes. (2) Data display, where information is organized to facilitate conclusions and actions. (3) Drawing conclusions, continuously undertaken by the researcher during fieldwork. (4) Validity testing to determine the reliability (trustworthiness) of a statement system in measuring what is researched. (5) Reliability testing, to ascertain the consistency of scores produced by an instrument. (6) Normality testing, to determine if data is normally distributed. (7) Homogeneity testing, to find out if the data is homogeneous. (8) Independent Sample T-Test for hypothesis testing, used to compare means of two unrelated data sets.

**Result**

**Table 1 Validity Test**

**Validity test**

Based on the validity test analysis results using the SPSS version 24 software, the validity testing of the questionnaire instrument was conducted to ensure that the research instrument is accurate, reliable, and distinguishable when used as a tool for data collection. A questionnaire is considered valid if a statement or item within it successfully measures what it is intended to measure. In validity testing, the comparison is made between the calculated r-value ($r_{hitung}$) and the r-table value ($r_{table}$) at a significance level of 0.05. If the calculated r-value is greater than the r-table value, then the indicator of the research variable can be deemed valid. This study used a questionnaire as a tool, utilizing a Likert scale. The questionnaire consisted of 38 questions. The validity test was conducted using SPSS version 24 with a 5% significance level, where the r-table value is 0.172, as shown in the table 1.

Based on the validity test conducted using a questionnaire on adherence to school discipline among 128 respondents with SPSS version 24, it was observed that there were a total of 128 students. Using a 5% significance level (0.05), if the calculated r-value ($r_{hitung}$) is greater than the r-table value ($r_{table}$), then the questionnaire item is declared valid. Conversely, if the calculated r-value is less than the r-table value, the item is deemed invalid. According to the results obtained from SPSS version 24, all 38 items measuring adherence to school discipline had a calculated r-value greater than the r-table value. Therefore, all 38 items in the instrument were declared valid.

**Reliability test**

After ascertaining the validity of the variables, the study proceeded to the reliability test of the data. The reliability test serves as a tool to measure a questionnaire, which acts as an indicator of variables or constructs. The aim of the reliability test is to determine whether the items of the instrument are reliable. This was carried out using SPSS version 24.

Based on the reliability test calculations using SPSS version 24 for the 38 questionnaire items, a calculated r-value ($r_{hitung}$) of 0.856 was obtained, which was then compared with the r-table value ($r_{table}$) of 0.172. From these results, it can be concluded that since the calculated r-value is greater than the r-table value ($r_{hitung} > r_{table}$), the questionnaire items can be considered reliable.
Based on the calculations above, the obtained significance value (sig. (2-tailed)) from the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test for the data at SMA Negeri 1 Sabang is 0.087, which is greater than 0.05, and for MAN Sabang, it is 0.200, also greater than 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that the data from SMA Negeri 1 Sabang are normally distributed as both values are greater than 0.05.

Based on Table 3, the Levene’s statistic for the homogeneity test is 0.275, and from the calculations, the obtained significance value (sig) is 0.601. Since 0.601 is greater than 0.05, it can be concluded that the data from SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang are considered homogenous, as the probability value is greater than 0.05.

Table 2 Normality Test of Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Statistics</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SMA Negeri 1 Sabang</td>
<td>0.103</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>0.087</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAN Sabang</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>0.200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the calculations above, the obtained significance value (sig. (2-tailed)) from the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test for the data at SMA Negeri 1 Sabang is 0.087, which is greater than 0.05, and for MAN Sabang, it is 0.200, also greater than 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that the data from SMA Negeri 1 Sabang are normally distributed as both values are greater than 0.05.

Table 3 Homogeneity Test
Table 4 Descriptive Statistics Analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adherence to School Discipline</th>
<th>SMA Negeri 1 Sabang</th>
<th>MAN Sabang</th>
<th>Valid N (listwise)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>119.94</td>
<td>125.03</td>
<td>125.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std.Davition</td>
<td>12.586</td>
<td>13.561</td>
<td>13.561</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From Table 4, it can be observed that the scores for adherence to school discipline at SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang range from 100 to 148, with an average (mean) score of 119.94 and a standard deviation of 12.586. Meanwhile, the scores for adherence to school discipline at MAN Sabang range from 103 to 156, with an average score of 125.03 and a standard deviation of 13.561.

Hypothesis testing

Based on the analysis results above, there is a significant difference in adherence to school discipline between SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang. The significance value (sig (2-tailed)) is found to be 0.029. This result is then compared to the significance level of 0.05. When comparing, the sig (2-tailed) value of 0.029 is less than 0.05, which leads to the acceptance of the research hypothesis Ha and the rejection of Ho. This indicates that there is a difference in student adherence to school discipline between SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang.

Based on the questionnaire results distributed to 128 respondents at SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang, and the decision rule that if the sig (2-tailed) value is less than 0.05, then Ha is accepted and Ho is rejected. Conversely, if the Sig (2-tailed) value is greater than 0.05, then Ho is accepted and Ha is rejected. As shown in Table 6, the significance level of t-calculated is 0.029, which is less than 0.05, leading to the conclusion that Ha is accepted and Ho is rejected. In other words, this demonstrates that there is a difference in student adherence to school discipline at SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang.

Tabel 6 Independent Sample T test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equal variances assumed</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>0.275</td>
<td>0.601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>-2.203</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Df</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>-2.203</td>
<td>125,305</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

According to Dinasyari (2018:3), obedience can be defined as the willingness to obey something willingly, being submissive, obedient, easily controlled, willing to perform tasks and duties voluntarily. Based on the researcher’s observations of SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang schools, all students have been adhering to the rules well. However, only a small number of students exhibit a lack of obedience. From the observations, rules that are often violated by students include not wearing proper attire or not following dress code rules, some students do not behave well and politely, and not participating in school activities.

Therefore, there is a need for awareness among students. Awareness in obeying school rules is an essential element for every student in shaping behavior that is in line with the values or norms in place. Students who have awareness are expected to be able to carry out their duties obediently and responsibly in accordance with the school’s regulations or rules. According to Jamanti (2014:24), there are several factors that can generate awareness, including self-awareness, communication, and responsibility. Knowing oneself well means improving the quality of life, which leads to awareness. Similarly, through communication, things that are not known become known, leading to awareness. Being responsible also generates awareness of the importance of something.
Samuel Bloom (in Jamanti, 2014:24) states that a person's awareness is influenced by three domains: cognitive (knowledge), affective (attitude), and psychomotor (behavior). Knowledge is the result of knowing and occurs after a person perceives a specific object. Attitude is a reaction or response that is still closed to someone towards a particular object. Psychomotor is related to skills or the ability to act after a person has received specific learning experiences. Benjamin Bloom, an expert in educational psychology, published this theory in 1956.

Both schools, SMA Negeri 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang, have rules and regulations as a form of school regulations, and it is the responsibility of the students to obey them. If these rules are violated, students will receive sanctions or punishments. Therefore, each school has determined the sanctions that will be given to students according to what they have violated. With the existence of punishments, student obedience will naturally develop.

In essence, both public schools and religious schools have the same function and purpose, which is to be educational institutions that aim to produce quality human resources. Each school has its own strengths and weaknesses. Although the methods and teachings taught are certainly different, every school wants to create educated students with good attitudes for the nation and country. This is because the younger generation will continue to pursue the goals desired by the country.

The statement above is supported by similar research conducted by Fitri Awan Arif Fimansyah (2017), Sumiati (2015), and Muhammad Kholid Mawardi (2015), who stated that there is a difference in obedience to rules between public schools and religious schools. This difference is due to differences in the school environment and different implementations. The differences are also influenced by the school's background and the teaching staff in shaping obedience in schools.

Based on the research conducted, the researcher concludes that there are two interrelated factors: internal and external factors. Internal factors exist within oneself, where students can control themselves and know what they can or cannot do. Therefore, there needs to be awareness in themselves about the importance of obedience for their well-being and success. Self-awareness becomes a strong motive for the formation of obedience within them. Obedience formed through awareness will have a stronger influence than if it were based on coercion or punishment.

According to Andini Purti Septirahmah (2021:621), internal factors are factors that exist within the individual. These internal factors include one's personality, self-awareness, interests, motivation, and mindset. Therefore, the influence from within oneself is stronger than the influence from the environment. If students do not have awareness of obedience, then anything they do will be in vain and not beneficial. It all starts with the students themselves taking the initiative and genuinely wanting to improve themselves.

The next factor is external, which involves the family environment. The family has the primary responsibility for instilling moral education and religious values. Therefore, the family's influence is significant in shaping a child's character. A child's personality depends on the thoughts and behaviors of both parents and their environment. Thus, the family plays a vital role in a child's development. However, the school environment also has an equally important role. According to one informant, the school is the second educational environment for students after the family to receive maximum education. In school, students gain knowledge and broader insights, helping them understand the meaning of life. The school has rules and regulations to ensure students cannot behave arbitrarily. For example, being late for school is not allowed, school uniforms must be neat, and completing assignments among many other rules. Teachers, like parents, set an example for students. Therefore, the school environment can shape students' obedience.

One of the informants from MAN Sabang often provides guidance to students, both during and outside of the learning process. Teachers always remind or advise students who violate the rules. Schools also approach students' parents to investigate whether the student has family issues. Sometimes, schools impose fines if students are absent, ranging from IDR 3,000 to IDR 5,000. This is done when students have repeatedly crossed the line. Therefore, the school must collaborate with students' parents to take appropriate action. One informant also said that the most important thing is to build discipline in students through the learning process.

Furthermore, support from the community plays a crucial role in creating a disciplined and safe environment. The community, in this context, refers to older individuals who are not related to the child. They can provide good examples, encourage or discourage certain behaviors, and guide children. Examples of community actions include involving children in
collective activities, teaching children not to litter or damage public facilities, and reprimanding children for inappropriate behavior. The statement above is supported by similar research conducted by Normasari (2013), Masfufatul Hikmah (2021), and Hanna Permata Hanifa (2019), which state that factors influencing students' obedience to rules include internal and external factors. These factors include self-control, emotional conditions, and adaptation to school, while external factors include a harmonious family environment.

Conclusion

Based on the results of research, data processing, and discussions that have been carried out regarding “comparison of students' obedience to rules and regulations at SMAN 1 Sabang and MAN Sabang”. It can be concluded that using SPSS version 24, the results are that there is a significant difference in students' obedience to school rules, which is expressed by Ha accepted which is based on the calculation results of sig 0.029 < 0.05. From the results of interviews that have been conducted, it was found that there are two factors that shape student obedience, namely internal factors and external factors. The internal factors referred to here are factors within the student himself. while external factors are factors from the family that can influence the student's personality in behavior. The school environment and community environment can only be supporting factors in shaping student obedience.

References


Terhadap Tingkat Kepercayaan Diri Siswa Kelas X Di SMA Negeri 1 Baitussalam Aceh Besar. [Skripsi Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry]. Banda Aceh